

Spring 2011

Article Comparison Worksheet

Michelle Bushey

Trinity University, mbushey@trinity.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.trinity.edu/infolit_grantdocs

Repository Citation

Bushey, Michelle, "Article Comparison Worksheet" (2011). *Information Literacy Resources for Curriculum Development*. 4.
https://digitalcommons.trinity.edu/infolit_grantdocs/4

This Instructional Material is brought to you for free and open access by the Information Literacy Committee at Digital Commons @ Trinity. It has been accepted for inclusion in Information Literacy Resources for Curriculum Development by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Trinity. For more information, please contact jcostanz@trinity.edu.

CHEM 4242. Spring 2011. Article comparison. Return to one of the five articles you research during the semester and choose one of the seminal articles cited by one of the articles. Use Scopus to forward search and find another article written by a different set of researchers that cites this seminal paper. Choose a publication date that is at least 1 year old. Read all three papers and answer the following questions. We will discuss this assignment in class on 4/26.

Name: _____

Date: _____

Full article citations (including title):

A. Your first chosen article:

B. Seminal Paper:

C. Second citing paper:

On a separate piece of paper, provide a brief summary of articles B and C. Use your own words to summarize the article indicating what you understand about the purpose of the study, the methods used, and the implications of the results. Indicate what remains unclear to you. 500-1000 words each(?).

Briefly answer each of the following:

Relevance

1. Do the abstracts indicate that the article is relevant to our course topics? How.

B.

C.

1b. Do the abstracts accurately and adequately summarize the article? Why or why not.

B.

C.

Author information.

2a. If there are multiple authors, who is the corresponding (main) author for each?

B. C.

What is the h factor for the corresponding author? B. C.

2c. Are there multiple affiliations for the different authors? What can be deduced about the affiliations of the corresponding and other authors?

B.

C.

Article Information.

3. What do the submitted and accepted dates tell us?

B.

C.

Journal Information.

4a. What is the relative quality of the journal and who is the audience?

B.

C.

4b. What is the impact factor for this journal?

B. C.

Using citations:

5a. Look at the reference list. Are the authors citing their own work? Have they published previously on the same topic? Are they citing others? What does the reference list tell us?

B.

C.

What is the citation rate for each article?

B.

C.

Refer back to the worksheet you completed for your original article and compare that article with article C. Can you make any preliminary assessment about the relative quality and importance of these two papers? On what are you basing this assessment? If assessment cannot be made, what additional information would you find helpful?